
Peter Anthony Kincaid

Refuting the notion that the coat of arms for James Kincaid of that Ilk's (d. 1604) wife represents Isabel Fleming; allegedly a grand daughter of the King Jame IV of Scotland.

In June 1995, Eugene Davis Kincaid III of Uvalde, Texas, USA printed and distributed a history of Kincaids titled *The origin and lineage of the ancient family of Kincaid of that Ilk with selected American descents*. In it he made the claim that the wife of James Kincaid of that Ilk, who died in 1604, was Isabel Fleming, a grand daughter of King James IV of Scotland. He wrote:

The writer visited the Clachan of Campsie Churchyard in 1990 and obtained an artistic representation of the tombstone doors, which bear Coats of Arms.

There are two tombstones which are used to seal the mausoleum as doors. On the first one are carved the Arms of Kincaid of that Ilk with the initials on either side of "J" and "K" representing James Kincaid of that Ilk, the husband. Directly below are the Arms of the Lords Fleming with the initials placed on either side of "I" and "F" representing Isabel Fleming, the wife. Further in the upper right hand corner of the Fleming Arms is carved a small heraldic device known as a cushion which is reposing beneath a Crown. This indicates that Isabel Fleming was descended from a mother who was an illegitimate daughter of the King.¹

Later in the same publication when discussing the wife of James Kincaid of that Ilk he adds:

He was married to Isabel Fleming the daughter of Malcolm 3rd Lord Fleming. One of the ancient tombstones which seals the the [sic] Kincaid Lennox Mausoleum in the Clachan of Campsie Churchyard attests to this fact. Emblazoned thereon are the arms of Kincaid of that Ilk representing the husband with the initials "J" and "K" for James Kincaid; and the Arms of the Lords Fleming representing the wife with the initials "I" and "F" for Isabel Fleming. Isabel Fleming's maternity is without doubt. Also chiseled onto the Coat of Arms of the Lords Fleming on the ancient tombstone is an heraldic device known as a cushion which indicates illegitimacy on the maternal side. Such a device reposing under a Crown is chiseled onto the Fleming Arms which corroborates the ample evidence that Malcolm 3rd Lord Fleming was married to Janet Stewart the natural daughter of King James IV and that Isabel was a child of that union².

It can be easily shown that there is no such device on the coat of arms in question. Furthermore, all we know of the name of James Kincaid of that Ilk's wife is her initials 'I F' or 'J F'. It is not clear what the first initial represents. While it looks like the letter I, it is in a form that also represented the letter J.

¹ Kincaid III, Eugene Davis. *The origin and lineage of the ancient family of Kincaid of that Ilk with selected American descents*. Uvalde, Texas: privately printed, 1995. p. 4.

² Ibid, p. 12. The "[sic]" was added to note the double "the" error made by Eugene.

The stone in question was inspected, photographed and recorded by the Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. This information was presented in their publication *Stirlingshire: an inventory of the Ancient Monuments*. They write:

*One bears the marginal inscription HEIR LYIS ANE HONORABIL MAN IAMES KINKAID OF THAT ILK QVHA DESISIT YE 13 OF FEBROVAR ANNO 1604, and bears two shields on the space within. The upper shield is flanked by the initials I K and is charged for Kincaid: A triple-towered castle, in chief two mullets. The two circular marks seen in the base may or may not be true heraldic charges. The lower shield, evidently that of his wife, is flanked by the initials I F and is charged: In chief three rosettes between three piles, in base an annulet.*³

It is clear that no royal cushion was found on the stone by the Commission. It is difficult to see how Eugene Davis Kincaid III, who has no heraldic credentials, could claim the device existed when the Royal Commission made no such claim for its inventory of Stirlingshire monuments.

Furthermore, Eugene Davis Kincaid III incorrectly identifies the coat of arms as being that of Malcolm, 3rd Lord Fleming. The seal of Malcolm, 3rd Lord Fleming has for coat of arms: "1st and 4th: A chevron within a royal tressure. 2nd and 3rd: Six fraises (3 and 3)."⁴ This is consistent with what was given in "an illuminated manuscript A.D. 1603-1605 ascribed to Sir David Lindsay, Lyon King of Arms" for Lord Fleming; namely "First and fourth, or, a chevron within a double tressure gules; second and third, azure, six fraises argent."⁵ This is the only evidence found or given to suggest that James Kincaid of that Ilk's wife was a Fleming; let alone a daughter of Malcolm, 3rd Lord Fleming. Without any supporting armorial evidence one has to accept that her name remains uncertain.

In 1998, this author presented a photo image of the stone in question to rec.heraldry; a newsgroup forum frequented by heraldic experts and enthusiasts. James Dempster of the Heraldry Society of Scotland responded that he preferred a blazon of "On a fess between three piles in chief and an annulet in base, three cinquefoils." However, neither James Dempster nor any other members of the forum noted any royal cushion.⁶

A photo of the coat of arms on the stone in question is shown on the next page. All can see that there is no royal cushion on her coat of arms on the tombstone.

One can only conclude that Eugene Davis Kincaid III made novice errors. In doing so he created yet another Kincaid myth.

³ The Royal Commission on the Ancient and Historical Monuments of Scotland. *Stirlingshire: An inventory of the Ancient Monuments*. 2 volumes. Edinburgh, 1963. Volume I, pages 161-162, no. 157.

⁴ MacDonald, William Rae. *Scottish Armorial Seals*. Edinburgh: William Green and Sons, 1904. p. 116, no. 936.

⁵ Stodart, Robert Riddle. *Scottish Arms being a collection of armorial bearings A.D. 1370-1678: Reproduced in Facsimile from contemporary manuscripts with heraldic and genealogical notes*. 2 volumes. Edinburgh: William Paterson, 1881. Volume 2, p. 283.

⁶ James Dempster (jdempster@easynet.co.uk). "Re: identifying arms on a Scottish tombstone." rec.heraldry. 25 July 1998, 3:00 am.



©Peter A. Kincaid. All rights reserved.
70 Royal Road
Fredericton, NB
Canada
E3A 4V2
7kincaid@nb.sympatico.ca

16 December 2011.